



SIF IRELAND
SUSTAINABLE & RESPONSIBLE
INVESTMENT FORUM

**SUSTAINABLE LOANS
ARE HERE TO STAY WHILE
GREEN BONDS CONTINUE
TO GROW**

BRIEFING NOTE PROVIDED BY

ARTHUR COX

JUNE 20TH, 2019

SUSTAINABLE LOANS ARE HERE TO STAY WHILE GREEN BONDS CONTINUE TO GROW

Sustainable loans are bilateral or syndicated credit facilities where the terms of the financing offer the borrower some form of incentive to achieve targets for improving their environmental social & governance (“ESG”) or sustainability performance. Green bonds are capital markets instruments which are intended to be used to finance expenditure on projects relating to climate change or achieving environmental benefits.

INTRODUCTION

There have been various positive developments relating to green finance over the past few years: for example, various sovereign and corporate issuers have issued green bonds in line with the [International Capital Market Association Green Bond Principles](#) (as discussed in more detail below) and numerous corporate borrowers have entered into loan financing transactions which comply with the green loan principles published by the Loan Market Association and other trade associations (the [“Green Loan Principles”](#)). However, recent [Bloomberg data](#) has shown that the issuance of “sustainability-linked” or “ESG-linked” loans (“sustainable loans”) outstripped that of green loans in 2018.

The performance incentive element to sustainable loans is usually achieved by means of a margin ratchet which adjusts the loan’s pricing by reference to one or more performance measures selected

by the parties (as an alternative to a margin ratchet tracking performance against financial covenants). The amount of any margin adjustment may not be particularly significant, particularly for an investment grade borrower which is likely to benefit from attractive pricing and/or may be entering a revolving credit facility which is unlikely to be fully drawn at all times.

However, this incentive-based approach is aimed primarily at demonstrating the commitment of all parties to a loan financing to achieving (and financing) sustainable business performance rather than minimising pricing. The relevant sustainability performance targets may be selected because they are particularly relevant to the borrower company’s core business or may instead track a basket of factors by way of the use of an ESG rating or score determined by an external consultant or advisor.

Sustainable loans potentially offer greater flexibility and wider scope for application for borrowers whose activities are outside of the core “green financing” space. For example, the [Green Loan Principles](#) currently require compliance with requirements for Use of Proceeds, Process for Project Evaluation and Selection, Management of Proceeds and Reporting. These requirements may not be workable for all transactions (given a borrower may not raise debt solely to fund specific green projects) or for all types of financing (it may be difficult to limit the use of a revolving facility to green purposes only rather than general corporate purposes) although the [Green Loan Principles](#) may be able to accommodate this issue by allowing for a “green loan” tranche within a larger revolving facility.

EXAMPLES OF SUSTAINABLE LOAN TRANSACTIONS INVOLVING BUSINESS-SPECIFIC ESG TARGETS OR EXTERNAL ESG MONITORING

1. Italian insurance company **ASSICURAZIONI GENERALI** has raised **revolving facilities** which link pricing to progress made in relation to certain sustainability initiatives;
2. **RED ELÉCTRICA DE ESPAÑA** (Spanish electricity network) entered into a **EUR800m RCF** with a margin ratchet linked to a ESG rating assigned by the independent provider Vigeo Eiris; and
3. **PENNON GROUP** and its subsidiary **SOUTH WEST WATER** have entered into **revolving credit facilities** with margin ratchets which are based on performance indicators linked both to their overall ESG performance and to specific targets for bathing water quality in the region supplied by South West Water.

SUSTAINABILITY LINKED LOAN PRINCIPLES

The Loan Market Association, the Loan Syndications and Trading Association and the Asia-Pacific Loan Market Association on 20 March 2019 published the **Sustainability Linked Loan Principles** (“SLLP”) to “promote the development and preserve the integrity” of sustainable loans by providing guidelines which capture the fundamental characteristics of these loan products. The **SLLP** set out four key components which should be addressed in a sustainable loan financing:

1. **RELATIONSHIP TO A BORROWER’S OVERALL CORPORATE SOCIAL RESPONSIBILITY (CSR) STRATEGY:**
each borrower should clearly communicate to its lenders its sustainability objectives and how these align with the sustainability performance targets proposed to be used in its sustainable loan financing, as well as providing details of any external standards or certifications to which they are seeking to conform.
2. **TARGET SETTING – MEASURING THE SUSTAINABILITY OF THE BORROWER:**
“performance targets should be ambitious and meaningful to the borrower’s business and should be tied to a sustainability improvement in relation to a predetermined performance target benchmark”. Borrowers may be encouraged to seek a third party opinion as to the appropriateness of their sustainability performance target as a condition precedent or otherwise borrowers should seek to demonstrate or develop the internal expertise to verify its approach.

3.

REPORTING:

borrowers should be encouraged to report information relating to their sustainability performance targets either in public reporting or in private reporting delivered to its lenders.

4.

REVIEW:

for publicly traded companies, it may be sufficient for lenders to rely on the borrower’s public disclosures (accompanied by appropriate audit/assurance statements) to verify its performance against its

sustainability performance targets. In other cases, a borrower’s performance should be independently verified by a qualified external reviewer, such as an auditor, environmental consultant and/ or independent ratings agency, at least once a year.

INCENTIVE FOR LENDERS TO PARTICIPATE

Regulators are increasingly focussed on sustainable finance: [recent legislative proposals](#) published by the European Commission in this area have been aimed at (amongst other things) ensuring that financial institutions have adequate systems and controls to manage the risks arising from climate change (including to their own business models) and that they support the transition to a low-carbon economy. There has also been some speculation as to whether future capital regulatory frameworks may potential offer preferential capital treatment for assets which comply with certain sustainability metrics.

Participation in sustainable loans is a means for banks to demonstrate their efforts in this area and also to highlight their performance against their own ESG goals. For example, [BNP Paribas](#) has stated that it aims to ensure that at least 40% of its loan assets are subject to specific systems to manage environmental/ social risks. Establishing credentials in sustainable loans is also of course a means for banks to show their alignment with their corporate customers’ ESG objectives. As the sustainable finance market develops, banks which originate sustainable loans may face conflicting dynamics in relation

to syndication and balance sheet management, as they may see incentives both to retain ownership of sustainable loan assets (in line with their own ESG goals) and also to sell down their exposure in order to tap into the growing institutional investor demand for sustainable finance assets. This is unlikely to be a pressing concern for as long as revolving facilities for investment grade corporate borrowers dominate the sustainable loan market but may become more relevant as drawn term loans and private placements become more common types of sustainable loan financings.

ICMA GREEN BOND PRINCIPLES

Since the launch of a climate awareness bond issued by the European Investment Bank in 2007, global interest in green bonds has soared, with annual issuance growing from zero to more than \$155bn globally. In support of this, ICMA's [Green Bond Principles](#) (GBP) have become the leading

framework globally for issuance of green bonds. The GBP are process guidelines for issuance of a green bond that have a number of functions: they ensure availability of information necessary to evaluate the environmental impact of a green bond, they provide issuers with guidance on what is

involved in launching a green bond and they guide the market towards standard disclosures on green bond transactions. Where an issuer proposes to issue a bond aligned with the GBP, it will usually obtain an independent opinion as to the compliance of its green bond with the GBP.

IRELAND'S SOVEREIGN GREEN BOND

In October 2018 Ireland (acting through the National Treasury Management Agency) raised €3 billion through the sale of Ireland first ever Irish Sovereign Green Bond (ISGB). In doing so, Ireland became one of only a handful

of EU countries to access the green bond market since Poland became the first country in 2016 to issue a sovereign green bond to finance climate and environmental investments. However, in a sign of growing appetite for sovereign

green bonds, The Netherlands issued its maiden sovereign green bond in May 2019 and both Ireland and France have indicated they will continue with further sovereign green bond issuances in the near future.

THE ISGB FRAMEWORK

Unlike some traditional issuers, sovereign issuers are often unable to specifically ringfence the proceeds of green bonds issuances, and instead commit to spend amounts matching the proceeds of the bond issuance for specified green purposes. In Ireland's case, this commitment is specified in the government's [Irish Sovereign Green Bond](#)

[Framework](#) (the **Framework**). The Framework is aligned with the GBP and sets out how an amount equal to the proceeds of any ISGB will be spent on 'eligible green projects' that promote, directly or indirectly, Ireland's transition to a low carbon, climate-resilient and environmentally sustainable economy. In addition to setting out eligible green categories (such as

sustainable water and wastewater management, renewable energy, climate change adaptation and clean transportation), the Framework commits to publication of an annual allocation report and a biennial eligible green project impact report. Ireland has obtained an opinion from an independent party as to the Framework's compliance with the GBP.

ARTHUR COX'S ROLE ON RECENT CAPITAL MARKETS TRANSACTIONS

Arthur Cox Listing Services acted as listing agent in Ireland for the listing of EUR 1,500,000,000 0.25 per cent. Notes due 21 May 2029 issued by the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development (the **IBRD**). The trade was dual listed on the Luxembourg Stock Exchange and Euronext Dublin.

The net proceeds from the sale of the Notes will be used by the IBRD to finance sustainable development projects and programs in IBRD's member countries (without being committed or earmarked for

lending to, or financing of, any particular projects or programs). The IBRD's financing is made available solely to middle income and creditworthy lower-income member countries who are working in partnership with IBRD to eliminate extreme poverty and boost shared prosperity, so that they can achieve equitable and sustainable economic growth in their national economies and find sustainable solutions to pressing regional and global economic and environmental problems. Projects and programs supported

by IBRD are designed to achieve a positive social impact and undergo a rigorous review and internal approval process aimed at safeguarding equitable and sustainable economic growth.

This transaction continues Arthur Cox's involvement in advising on green and sustainable finance, which includes its role as advisor to the managers on the issuance of Ireland's first sovereign green bond referred to above.

AUTHORS 



MATTHEW DUNN

Partner, Head of Project and Infrastructure Finance

+353 1 920 2020
matt.dunn@arthurcox.com



GRAINNE HENNESSY

Partner, Finance

+353 1 920 1202
grainne.hennessy@arthurcox.com



BRENDAN WALLACE

Senior Associate, Debt Capital Markets

+353 1 920 1069
brendan.wallace@arthurcox.com



CHARLOTTE UPTON

Senior Associate, Project Finance

+353 1 920 1113
charlotte.upton@arthurcox.com